Independent Audit Committee

City & County of Denver

Meeting Minutes
Thursday, June 15, 2017, 9:00 a.m.

Opening
Chairman Timothy M. O'Brien, CPA, Auditor, called the meeting to order.

Members Present
Florine Nath, Edward Scholz, Charles Scheibe, Leslie Mitchell, Rudy Payan and Jack Blumenthal were present.

Also Present
Committee staff Edyie Thompson was also in attendance.

Approval of May 18, 2017 Minutes
The minutes were approved as written.

Audit Report Briefing: Data Driven Policing (DDACTS)
Audit Manager Katja Freeman, Lead Auditor Vilma Balnyte, Senior Auditor Robert Persichitte, Senior Auditor Darrell Finke, and Data Analytics and Methodology Specialist Sam Gallaher presented the audit findings and recommendations.
David Quinones, DPD Deputy Chief of Operations, Christine Wyckoff, DPD Data Analysis Unit Director, Emily Pabst, DPD Associate Statistical Researcher, and Elizabeth Shahan, DPD Management Analyst, were present to respond to the audit report.

For the full text of the report, including auditee actions, please visit www.denvergov.org/auditor. Click on the Audit Services tab, then Audit Reports. This report is published under the 2017 Audit Reports header and is titled "Data Driven Policing." View the video recording of the audit report discussion under the Audit Committee tab at www.denvergov.org/auditor. Click on the "Watch Audit Committee meetings" button at the top of the page. The most recent video will be listed first.

The Department of Safety disagreed with all nine of the Audit Team's findings and recommendations. The recommendations and the Department of Safety responses from the audit report are summarized below.

Recommendation 1.1
Commitment to DDACTS – DPD command staff should determine whether the department will continue using DDACTS as a model to efficiently and effectively allocate resources to support its mission to prevent crime.

Auditee Response: Disagree

Recommendation 1.2
DDACTS Documentation within Department's Strategy – If DPD command staff decides to continue pursuing the DDACTS model, improvements should be made to the integration of DDACTS into the department's overall strategy by establishing clear objectives and performance measures, defining roles and responsibilities, and describing the relationship of DDACTS with other short-term policing initiatives.

Auditee Response: Disagree

Recommendation 1.3
Additional Analyses for DDACTS Zone Design — The DAU should conduct additional analyses using available crime and traffic accident data, as suggested by the DDACTS Operational Guidelines. The DAU should then determine whether the additional analyses warrant changing or refining existing DDACTS zone boundaries. We recommend that the following two specific analyses be conducted:

First, the DAU should use spatial analyses to identify crime and traffic accident hot spots separately, and then determine where crime and traffic accidents overlap.

Second, the DAU should determine whether specific crime are associated with each DDACTS zone and provide that information to the appropriate DPD operations personnel.
.

Auditee Response: Disagree

Recommendation 1.4
Roles and Responsibilities – DPD should establish roles and responsibilities for DDACTS execution allowing DPD employees to understand the extent of their responsibility.

Auditee Response: Disagree

Recommendation 1.5
Key Resource – DPD should dedicate a resource to be responsible for the Citywide DDACTS Implementation.

Auditee Response: Disagree

Recommendation 1.6
Training, Reporting, Information Sharing – DPD should improve and document training, reporting, and information sharing efforts to promote knowledge and acceptance of DPD's DDACTS model for personnel executing DDACTS.

Auditee Response: Disagree

Recommendation 1.7
Improv Monitoring, Evaluation, Adjustments – DPD should monitor, evaluate, and adjust its DDACTS model. Specifically, the frequency of DDACTS monitoring or evaluation and the roles and responsibilities of the DAU and district operational personnel in these activities should be defined.

Auditee Response: Disagree

Recommendation 1.8
Additional Performance Measures and Analyses — To improve its process for monitoring and evaluating the effectiveness of DDACTS, the DAU should use additional commonly accepted performance measures and conduct additional analyses for determining the impact of policing efforts.

Auditee Response: Disagree

Recommendation 1.9
Data Reliability — DPD should design and test the implementation of internal controls surrounding the data reliability for any data used for its DDACTS model and document that process

Auditee Response: Disagree

Follow-Up Audit Report Briefing: DIA Network Device Security Management
Audit Manager Kevin Sear and Senior IT Auditor Karin Doughty presented the follow-up audit recommendations and findings. Robert Kastelitz, Senior Vice President of DIA Business Technologies & CIO and Usha Yarlagadda, DIA Director of Internal Audit was present to respond to the follow-up audit report. For the full text of the follow-up report, including auditee actions, please visit www.denvergov.org/auditor. Click on the Audit Services tab, then Audit Reports. This follow-up report is published under the 2014 Audit Reports header below its corresponding original audit, dated June 2014.

The follow-up audit report was discussed. The findings summarized below, indicate that DIA (DEN) Business Technologies has fully implemented all recommendations and adequately mitigated the risk identified during the original audit.

Recommendation 1.1—IMPLEMENTED
The Director of Operations for the DIA Business Technologies division should ensure removal of the accounts for the individuals who are no longer authorized to configure firewalls and implement a periodic review process to ensure that unauthorized accounts are removed timely on an employee's last day or when an employee transfers to a new position.

Recommendation 1.2—IMPLEMENTED
The Director of Operations for the DIA Business Technologies division should ensure removal of the IP address that is no longer in use from the firewall management tool and implement a periodic review process to assess the IP addresses that are allowed to configure firewalls, removing any that are no longer needed

Recommendation 1.3—IMPLEMENTED
The Director of Operations for the DIA Business Technologies division should ensure that passwords are changed for network devices at least every ninety days as required by the DIA IT Acceptable Use Policy and implement a compensating
control such as a recurring notification that alerts administrators that passwords
need to be changed.

Recommendation 1.4—IMPLEMENTED
The Director of Operations for the DIA Business Technologies division should ensure changes to network devices are periodically reviewed using a monitoring tool and that the changes correspond with an approved change ticket.

Recommendation 1.5—IMPLEMENTED
The Director of Operations for the DIA Business Technologies division should ensure that firewall backups are performed prior to every configuration change or at a minimum every 30 days. In the event that a previous configuration restoration point is needed to ensure continued operations.

General Business
Auditor O'Brien informed the committee that the Wastewater Analysis draft report would not be presented at today's meeting and rescheduled for another date. He also reminded the committee of the upcoming meeting to discuss the 2016 Single Audit and Management Letter on July 6, 2017 at the Wellington Webb Building, Room 1.B.6 in the Clerk & Recorder's Office, 1st floor.

The next meeting is on Thursday, July 20, 2017 at 9:00am in the Parr-Widener Room (#389) of the City and County Building, 3rd floor.

With no other business, the Committee adjourned at 10:57 a.m.

Prepared by Edyie Thompson, Audit Committee staff